Care that Fits
Care that’s Fit to Care

Rochester, Minnesota
October 7, 2019

Ian Hargraves Ph.D.
Assistant Professor of Medicine
Knowledge and Evaluation Research Unit
Mayo Clinic
Hargraves.Ian@mayo.edu
Disclosures

I do **not** have financial relationships to disclose.
30,000 journals
29,000,000 articles
14 years training
$3,800,000,000,000
Maria Luisa has care but is it fit to care?
Care that fits Maria Luisa’s life
Care that’s fit to serve Maria Luisa and her life
Care that fits
Maria Luisa’s life
Care that’s fit to
serve Maria Luisa
and her life
as if care were something warehoused within care facilities, taken off shelves, and delivered by delivery agents (providers) and applied to patients
Capacity
providing care that is respectful of and responsive to individual patient preferences, needs, and values, and ensuring that patient values guide all clinical decisions

Institute of medicine, 2001
Capacity
Person / preferences
Providing care that is respectful of and responsive to individual patient preferences, needs, and values, and ensuring that patient values guide all clinical decisions

Institute of medicine, 2001
Capacity
Person / preferences
Problem / experience
Humanity
fitting
problems
no problem

diagnosis
prognosis
problem list
complexity
need
no problem

experience

diagnosis
prognosis
problem list
complexity
need
Conversational Inquiry
Beginning from a Troubled Human Situation …

What is the situation that demands care?

What is the care the situation demands?
Is there a problem?

Troubled Experience

Is there a possibility of action?
Troubled Experience

Is there a problem?

Discernment

What is the problem?

What can we do?
What will we do?
Troubled Experience
Is there a problem?

Discernment
What is the problem?
What can we do? What will we do?

Method
How do we go about judging or characterizing?
How do we go about acting?
Troubled Experience

Is there a problem?

Is there a possibility of action?

Discernment

What is the problem?

What can we do? What will we do?

Method

How do we go about judging or characterizing?

How do we go about acting?

Principle

Why, or on what basis do we judge?

Why will we act?
Conversational Inquiry
Beginning from a Troubled Human Situation …

What is the situation that demands care?

- **Troubled Experience**
  - Is there a problem?
  - Is there a possibility of action?

- **Discernment**
  - What is the problem?
  - What can we do? What will we do?

- **Method**
  - How do we go about judging or characterizing?
  - How do we go about acting?

- **Principle**
  - Why, or on what basis do we judge?
  - Why will we act?

What is the care the situation demands?
Are these areas of your life a source of satisfaction, burden, or both?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Satisfaction</th>
<th>Burden</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>My family and friends</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My work</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Free time, relaxation, fun</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Faith or personal meaning</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Where I live</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Getting out and transportation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Being active</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My rest and comfort</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My emotional life</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My senses and memory</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eating well</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

What are the things that your doctors or clinic have asked you to do to care for your health?

Do you feel that they are a help, a burden, or both?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Help</th>
<th>Burden</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>example: come in for appointments</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>example: take aspirin</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Help</th>
<th>Burden</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Current Risk of having a heart attack
Risk for 100 people like you who do not medicate for heart problems

Over 10 years

21 people will have a heart attack

79 people will have no heart attack

Future Risk of having a heart attack
Risk for 100 people like you who do take standard dose statins

Over 10 years

16 people will have a heart attack

79 people will have no heart attack

5 people will be saved from a heart attack by taking medicine
Care that makes intellectual, practical, and emotional sense

• Is consistent with evidence-based practice
Care that makes intellectual, practical, and emotional sense

• Is consistent with evidence-based practice
• Can be implemented and sustained in a patient’s day-to-day life
Care that makes intellectual, practical, and emotional sense

• Is consistent with evidence-based practice
• Can be implemented and sustained in a patient’s day-to-day life
• Addresses, supports, and advances the emotional experience of illness and treatment
fit for purpose
shared decision making
What is the problem to which SDM is the solution?

- Poor clinician behavior
- Insufficient patient involvement
- Uncaring Interpersonal communication
- Lack of patient and clinician understanding
- Underdeveloped empathy
- Evidence uncertainty
- Unclear information
- Variation of patient preference and values
- Compromised ethical principles
- Practice variation
- …
What is the problem to which SDM is the solution?

- Poor clinician behavior
- Insufficient patient involvement
- Uncaring Interpersonal communication
- Lack of patient and clinician understanding
- Underdeveloped empathy
- Evidence uncertainty
- Unclear information
- Variation of patient preference and values
- Compromised ethical principles
- Practice variation
- …
What is the purpose of SDM?

The purpose of SDM, like all medical decision making is to advance patient problems.
What is the purpose of SDM?

We make decisions in order to act well, not to decide
A conversation made necessary by a problem in which patients and clinicians figure out what to do
Many human problems

Many methods and purposes of SDM
Rachel

1: Dissatisfied with her birth control
Rachel

2: Conflicted by the baby’s delivery
Rachel

3: Admitted to the ICU with sepsis
Rachel

4: Rachel’s husband and parents fight
Which is best?

What do we want?

What matters?

How do we manage?

All instances where patients, families, and clinicians are making decisions together
Different
Situations
Problems
Discussions
Interactions
Purposes
SDMs

Which is best?

What matters?

What do we want?

How do we manage?
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Example</th>
<th>Purpose: To resolve</th>
<th>Kind &amp; Focus</th>
<th>Situation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><img src="image" alt="Diagram" /></td>
<td>Which alternative is best?</td>
<td>Alternatives</td>
<td>It is uncertain what the harmful and beneficial outcomes of alternative interventions will be for a patient and their preferences</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Hargraves *et al.*
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Example</th>
<th>Purpose: To resolve</th>
<th>Kind &amp; Focus</th>
<th>Situation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><img src="example1.png" alt="Image" /></td>
<td>Which alternative is best?</td>
<td>Alternatives</td>
<td>It is uncertain what the harmful and beneficial outcomes of alternative interventions will be for a patient and their preferences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><img src="example2.png" alt="Image" /></td>
<td>What do we want, and can agree on?</td>
<td>People Choosing &amp; Agreeing</td>
<td>Personal or professional concerns, interests, or agenda are ambiguous or in conflict between or within parties</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Example</th>
<th>Purpose: To resolve</th>
<th>Kind &amp; Focus</th>
<th>Situation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>![Question Mark]</td>
<td>Which alternative is best?</td>
<td><strong>Alternatives</strong></td>
<td>It is uncertain what the harmful and beneficial <strong>outcomes of alternative interventions</strong> will be for a patient and their preferences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>![People Talking]</td>
<td>What do we want, and can agree on?</td>
<td><strong>People Choosing &amp; Agreeing</strong></td>
<td>Personal or professional concerns, interests, or agenda are ambiguous or in conflict between or within parties</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>![People with Diagram]</td>
<td>How do we manage and resolve the current situation?</td>
<td><strong>Problematic Situation</strong></td>
<td>The <strong>problematic human situation</strong> and what to do about it is intellectually, practically, and emotionally fraught</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Example</th>
<th>Purpose: To resolve</th>
<th>Kind &amp; Focus</th>
<th>Situation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><img src="image1" alt="Illustration" /></td>
<td>Which alternative is best?</td>
<td>Alternatives</td>
<td>It is uncertain what the harmful and beneficial outcomes of alternative interventions will be for a patient and their preferences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><img src="image2" alt="Illustration" /></td>
<td>What do we want, and can agree on?</td>
<td>People Choosing &amp; Agreeing</td>
<td>Personal or professional concerns, interests, or agenda are ambiguous or in conflict between or within parties</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><img src="image3" alt="Illustration" /></td>
<td>How do we manage and resolve the current situation?</td>
<td>Problematic Situation</td>
<td>The problematic human situation and what to do about it is intellectually, practically, and emotionally fraught</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><img src="image4" alt="Illustration" /></td>
<td>What ultimately matters?</td>
<td>Humanity</td>
<td>The humanity of an individual or community is compromised</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Which is best?

What matters?

Pros and Cons

Stories
care that’s centered by people and their problems
PUTTING THE PATIENT AT THE CENTER
Patient experience encompasses the range of *interactions* that patients have with the *health care system*.

AHRQ
Patient experience encompasses the range of *interactions* that patients have with the health care system

AHRQ

Experience is what *care joins* it is not the effect of an interaction
With thanks to Maria Luisa and her granddaughter Ana Castañeda Guarderas

Ian Hargraves Ph.D. (Design)
Assistant Professor of Medicine
Knowledge and Evaluation Research Unit
Mayo Clinic
Hargraves.ian@mayo.edu